

Overconfident: How Economic and Health Fault Lines Left the Middle East and North Africa Ill-Prepared to Face COVID-19



Overconfident: How Economic and Health Fault Lines Left the Middle East and North Africa Ill-Prepared to Face COVID-19

2021 International Bank for Reconstruction and Development / The World Bank
1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC 20433
Telephone: 202-473-1000; Internet: www.worldbank.org

Some rights reserved

1 2 3 4 24 22 21

This work is a product of the staff of The World Bank with external contributions. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this work do not necessarily reflect the views of The World Bank, its Board of Executive Directors, or the governments they represent. The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this work. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgment on the part of The World Bank concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

Nothing herein shall constitute or be considered to be a limitation upon or waiver of the privileges and immunities of The World Bank, all of which are specifically reserved.

Rights and Permissions



This work is available under the Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 IGO license (CC BY 3.0 IGO) <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/igo>. Under the Creative Commons Attribution license, you are free to copy, distribute, transmit, and adapt this work, including for commercial purposes, under the following conditions:

Attribution—Please cite the work as follows: Gatti, Roberta; Lederman, Daniel; Fan, Rachel Yuting; Hatefi, Arian; Nguyen, Ha; Sautmann, Anja; Sax, Joseph Martin; Wood, Christina A. 2021. “Overconfident: How Economic and Health Fault Lines Left the Middle East and North Africa Ill-Prepared to Face COVID-19” *Middle East and North Africa Economic Update* (October), Washington, DC: World Bank. Doi: 10.1596/978-1-4648-1798-4. License: Creative Commons Attribution CC BY 3.0 IGO

Translations—If you create a translation of this work, please add the following disclaimer along with the attribution: *This translation was not created by The World Bank and should not be considered an official World Bank translation. The World Bank shall not be liable for any content or error in this translation.*

Adaptations—If you create an adaptation of this work, please add the following disclaimer along with the attribution: *This is an adaptation of an original work by The World Bank. Views and opinions expressed in the adaptation are the sole responsibility of the author or authors of the adaptation and are not endorsed by The World Bank.*

Third-party content—The World Bank does not necessarily own each component of the content contained within the work. The World Bank therefore does not warrant that the use of any third-party-owned individual component or part contained in the work will not infringe on the rights of those third parties. The risk of claims resulting from such infringement rests solely with you. If you wish to re-use a component of the work, it is your responsibility to determine whether permission is needed for that re-use and to obtain permission from the copyright owner. Examples of components can include, but are not limited to, tables, figures, or images.

All queries on rights and licenses should be addressed to World Bank Publications, The World Bank Group, 1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC 20433, USA; e-mail: pubrights@worldbank.org.

ISBN (electronic): 978-1-4648-1798-4

DOI: 10.1596/978-1-4648-1798-4

Photo credits in this publication. Further permission required for reuse.

Cover photo credit: MJGraphics/Shutterstock.com

Contents

Acknowledgements	iv
Abbreviations	v
Foreword.....	vi
Chapter 1. Introduction and Overview of Findings	1
Chapter 2. A Tenuous and Uneven Economic Recovery in an Ongoing Pandemic	3
Impact of Public Health Surveillance	5
Impact of Rising Commodity Prices	6
Chapter 3. MENA's Truncated Economic Transitions and Their Implications for Economic Growth	9
Chapter 4. MENA's Truncated Demographic and Epidemiological Transitions.....	13
MENA's Truncated Demographic Transition.....	13
MENA's Truncated Epidemiological Transition.....	15
Chapter 5. Overconfident: The State of MENA's Public Health Systems on the Eve of the Pandemic	20
Inadequate Financing Hinders Health System Resources	20
Financial, Human, and Physical Resource Limitations Challenge Health Systems.....	23
MENA's Public Health System Preparedness versus Self Assessments	24
Health Systems Governance Has a Way to Go	27
Chapter 6. Covid-19 in MENA: A Stress Test.....	29
Covid-19 in MENA: A Stress Test on Resilience in a Data Deprived Environment.....	30
Chapter 7. Forward Look: What Empirical Evidence Says about the Uses and Misuses of Public Health Data.....	38
References	46
Appendix	54
Appendix A1. Growth Adjustments and Covid-19 Test Positivity Rates.....	54
Appendix A2. Impact of Commodity Price Shocks on GDP Growth.....	54
Appendix A3. Estimates of Truncated Long-Term Transitions prior to the Covid-19 Shock in MENA	55
Appendix A4. The State of MENA's Public Health Systems on the Eve of Covid-19	56
Data Appendix.....	60

List of Figures

Chapter 2. A Tenuous and Uneven Economic Recovery in an Ongoing Pandemic

Figure 2.1. GDP Level and per Capita Forecasts	4
Figure 2.2. An Uneven Recovery	4
Figure 2.3. Growth Adjustments and Positivity Rate	4
Figure 2.4. Oil Prices and Futures	6
Figure 2.5. Exposure to International Commodity Markets	7

Chapter 3. MENA's Truncated Economic Transitions and Their Implications for Economic Growth

Figure 3.1. Government Expenditure in Total GDP in 2009 and 2019	9
Figure 3.2. Changes in Government Expenditure over GDP, 2019 minus 2009 Relative to Benchmarks by Levels of Development	10
Figure 3.3. Shares of Public Employment in Non-GCC MENA Relative to Benchmarks by Levels of Development	10
Figure 3.4. Public Health Expenditures over Public Sector Wage Bills versus GDP per Capita, 2018	11
Figure 3.5. Spending on Preventive Health and Health System Functions	11

Chapter 4. MENA's Truncated Demographic and Epidemiological Transitions

Figure 4.1. Fertility Rates versus Gross National Income per Capita	13
Figure 4.2. Fertility Rates in MENA Compared to Benchmarks by Levels of Development.....	14
Figure 4.3. Obesity in MENA and the Rest of the World	16
Figure 4.4. The Illusion of Healthy Populations when Age Demographics Differ across Countries.....	16
Figure 4.5. Burden of Communicable and Non-Communicable Diseases.....	18
Figure 4.6. Age-Standardized Deaths from Non-Communicable Diseases per 100,000 Population in MENA Relative to Income-Level Benchmarks	18

Chapter 5. Overconfident: The State of MENA's Public Health Systems on the Eve of the Pandemic

Figure 5.1. Health Spending in MENA Compared to Level of Development	21
Figure 5.2. Sources of Health Spending as a Share of Total Health Spending.....	22
Figure 5.3. Skilled Health Worker Density	22
Figure 5.4. Primary Health Care Facility Density	24

Chapter 6. Covid-19 in MENA: A Stress Test

Figure 6.1. Reasons for Service Disruptions	31
Figure 6.2. Excess Mortality P-score	33
Figure 6.3. Containment and Health Index in MENA - Intensity of Covid-19 Containment Policies over Time	34

Chapter 7. Forward Look: What Empirical Evidence Says about the Uses and Misuses of Public Health Data

Figure 7.1. Data Availability Assessment for MENA	39
---	----

List of Tables

Chapter 5. Overconfident: The State of MENA's Public Health Systems on the Eve of the Pandemic	
Table 5.1. Overconfident MENA: Public Health System Preparedness versus Self-Assessments	26
Table 5.2. Correlates of Testing per Capita	27
Chapter 6. Covid-19 in MENA: A Stress Test	
Table 6.1. Reported Covid-19 Indicators as of September 13, 2021	32
Table 6.2. Seroprevalence Studies in the Region Compared with the Official Confirmed Prevalence.....	33
Table 6.3. Ratio between Excess Mortality and the Reported Covid Deaths	34
Table 6.4. Vaccination Progress by World Region as of August 9, 2021	36
Chapter 7. Forward Look: What Empirical Evidence Says about the Uses and Misuses of Public Health Data	
Table 7.1. The Many Roles of Data in Modern Health Care Systems	40
Appendix	54
Table A1.1. Changes in GDP per Capita Forecasts and Covid-19 Test Positivity Rate	54
Table A2.1. Impact of Commodity Price Shocks.....	55
Table A4.1. Variables Included in Each Thematic Pillar	58
Data Appendix	60
Appendix Table B1. World Bank's Growth, Current Account and Fiscal Account Forecasts	60
Appendix Table B2. Growth Forecast Adjustments by the World Bank	61
Appendix Table B3. Selected Health Indicators in MENA and the Rest of the World by Income Groups circa 2019	62

List of Boxes

Chapter 7. Forward Look: What Empirical Evidence Says about the Uses and Misuses of Public Health Data	
Box 7.1. The Spread of Information, the Public's Response to Policy Measures, and the Role of Trust in a Crisis	42

Acknowledgements

The MENA Economic Update is a product of the Office of the Chief Economist for the Middle East and North Africa Region (MNACE) of the World Bank. The report was written by Roberta Gatti (Regional Chief Economist), Daniel Lederman (Deputy Chief Economist), Rachel Yuting Fan (Team Lead), Arian Hatefi, Ha Nguyen, Anja Sautmann, Joseph Martin Sax, and Christina A. Wood.

We are indebted to Abdo Yazbeck for his ideas and advice that shaped the report, particularly concerning the role of economic, demographic and epidemiological transitions. Inputs from Johannes G. Hoogeveen and Minh Cong Nguyen are much appreciated.

Claudio Jeremias Rojas Guzman and Rana Mohamed Amr Mohamed Nabil Lotfi provided invaluable research assistance.

Helpful comments were provided by Ferid Belhaj (Regional Vice President), Stefan G. Koeberle, Jesko S. Hentschel, Nadir Mohammed, Fatima Zehra Shah, Ismail Radwan, Tania Meyer, Nancy Lozano Gracia, Anush Bezhanyan, Jens Kromann, Paul Welton, Laura De Castro Zoratto, Sara B. Alnashar, Majid Kazemi, Ashwaq Natiq Maseeh, Anastasia Janzer-Araji, Saadia Refaat, Wael Mansour, Wissam Harake, Luan Zhao, Jaime de Pinies, Dalia Al Kadi, Amr Elshalakani, Paul Moreno Lopez, and Javier Diaz Cassou.

We gratefully acknowledge the World Bank's MENA Health Sector team for its overall support, guidance, and comments, namely Rekha Menon (Practice Manager), Mansour Faisal H Alrumayyan, Sherin Varkey, Sameh El-Saharty, Son Nam Nguyen, Denizhan Duran, Fatima El Kadiri El Yamani, Iryna Postolovska, Fernando Xavier Montenegro Torres, Takahiro Hasumi, Christopher H. Herbst, Jorge A. Coarasa, and Ronald Eduardo Gomez Suarez.

Susan Fleming provided timely advice on messaging during the final stages in the production of this report.

We thank James L. Rowe Jr for editing the manuscript. Help from the Translation and Printing & Multimedia Unit of the World Bank's Global Corporate Solutions is acknowledged. Stellar administrative support was provided by Swati Raychaudhuri.